

REMARKS

The applicant respectfully requests reconsideration in view of the following remarks.

Claims 4, 13, 15-18 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(b) as being anticipated by de Jong (US Patent 4,929,475) ("deJong"). Claims 1-3, 5-7, 12, and 14 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(e) as being anticipated by Bruchmann et al. (US 2005/0147834) ("Bruchmann"). The applicant respectfully traverses these rejections.

Rejection Over de Jong

Claims 4, 13, 15-18 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(b) as being anticipated by de Jong. The Examiner argues that example III of de Jong discloses a ethylhexylphthalate (Platinol AH), which applicant has disclosed as a cyclohexane polycarboxylic acid derivative in the specification (see the bottom of page 2 of the Office Action).

Ethylhexylphthalate (Platinol AH) is not what the applicant is claiming in claim 4. The Examiner is in error. It is acknowledged that page 38, lines 4-20 also refer to Platinol AH. However, the Examiner failed to notice that the respective paragraph refers to hydrogenation products of the commercially available benzene carboxylic esters, such as Platinol AH, see page 38, line 7 of the specification. De Jong discloses as plasticizer ethylhexylphthalate, which is a benzene-1,2 dicarboxylic acid ester (phthalic acid = benzene-1,2-dicarboxylic acid), whereas claim 4 of the instant invention refers to cyclohexane polycarboxylic acid derivatives, i.e. the hydrogenation product of the respective benzene polycarboxylic acid derivatives.

Benzene is unsaturated and would contain double bonds in the ring versus the claimed cyclohexane which is saturated and does not contain double bonds. Therefore, de Jong does not anticipate the subject matter of claims 4, 13 and 15-18. For the above reasons, this rejection should be withdrawn.

Rejection Over Bruchmann

Claims 1-3, 5-7, 12, and 14 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(e) as being anticipated by Bruchmann. The Examiner will note that the PCT counter part of Bruchmann (WO 03/093002) is cited at page 40, line 14 of the applicant's specification. The Examiner cites paragraphs [0020], [0050]-[0070] and part of [0084], without indicating which paragraph might disclose a cyclohexane polycarboxylic acid derivative.

As a matter of fact, Bruchmann does not disclose any cyclohexane polycarboxylic acid derivative. There appears to be a misunderstanding on the side of the Examiner as to the nature of cyclohexane polycarboxylic acid, which is obviously confused with benzene carboxylic acid. It is acknowledged that Bruchmann discloses various dicarboxylic acids and polycarboxylic acids and derivatives thereof (polyesters of polycarboxylic acids with diols or polyalcohols having a functionality of three or more), such as phthalic acid, isophthalic acid or terephthalic acid (which are the isomeric benzene dicarboxylic acids) or benzene dicarboxylic acid and benzene tetracarboxylic acids (see paragraph nos. [0058] and [0062] of Bruchmann), but there is no disclosure of cyclohexane polycarboxylic acid (derivatives), with the latter being the hydrogenation product of the former. Therefore, Bruchmann does not anticipate the subject matter of claims 1-3, 5-7, 12 and 14.

The Examiner will note that the present claims 5 and 15, which clearly refer to ring-hydrogenated mono- and dialkylesters of phthalic acid, isophthalic acid and terephthalic acid, ring-hydrogenated mono-, di- and trialkyesters of trimellitic acid etc. For the above reasons, this rejection should be withdrawn.

In view of the above amendment, applicant believes the pending application is in condition for allowance.

Applicant believes no fee is due with this response. However, if a fee is due, please charge our Deposit Account No. 03-2775, under Order No. 13838-00003-US from which the undersigned is authorized to draw.

Dated: July 8, 2008

Respectfully submitted,

Electronic signature: /Ashley I. Pezzner/
Ashley I. Pezzner
Registration No.: 35,646
CONNOLLY BOVE LODGE & HUTZ LLP
1007 North Orange Street
P. O. Box 2207
Wilmington, Delaware 19899-2207
(302) 658-9141
(302) 658-5614 (Fax)
Attorney for Applicant